

ORPHEUS SELF-EVALUATION QUESTIONNAIRE

16-06-2018

This questionnaire is a tool for self-evaluation of PhD training programmes. It is based on the publication *Best Practices for PhD Training*, published 2016 by ORPHEUS (Organisation for PhD Education in Biomedicine and Health Sciences in the European System) and AMSE (Association of Medical Schools in Europe). This publication is available on www.orpheus-med.org and is based on work done over many years by ORPHEUS, AMSE and the World Federation for Medical Education. It represents a consensus by around 100 institutions from almost all European countries. The document provides a number of recommendations of what are considered to be best practices, and has two types of recommendations:

- **Basic Recommendations:** Recommendations that are thought to be particularly important.
- **Quality Development:** Further recommendations that are in accordance with international consensus about good practice.

In addition, there are **Annotations** that are used to clarify, amplify or exemplify expressions in the recommendations, and also to indicate flexibility.

The purpose of the questionnaire is to provide a framework for institutions to discuss and reflect on their PhD programmes a basis for deciding if improvements might be made. The effectiveness of the process will likely be enhanced if relevant stakeholders (e.g. PhD candidates, supervisors, research directors, graduate school administration, graduate school leadership) are involved in completing the form.

ORPHEUS believes that completion of the form will in itself have value for the institution, and the questionnaire is thus part of ORPHEUS' aim of promoting the enhancement of PhD training in Europe and elsewhere. ORPHEUS may, however, use the questionnaire as a basis for applying for

- a) an *ORPHEUS Evaluation Certificate*, or
- b) an *ORPHEUS Label*.

Such institutions should also complete the form on the last page of this document.

Details of the procedures for applying for these awards are provided on www.orpheus-med.org.

Institutions interested in entering this process should contact the President of ORPHEUS, Prof. Robert Harris, Karolinska Institute, Stockholm, Sweden, Robert.Harris@ki.se and the chairman of the ORPHEUS Labelling Board, Prof. Michael Mulvany, Aarhus University, Aarhus, Denmark, mm@farm.au.dk.

The questionnaire

Institution	Institute of Health Sciences, Bezmialem Vakif University
--------------------	--

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)	Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
1. Research environment			
#1: BR 1.1	There should be a strong research environment around every PhD project, either within the institution or within collaborating institutions.	Yes	<p><i>Describe research areas covered by the institution. Give examples of e.g. 5 key papers. Provide information about institution ranking if relevant.</i></p> <p>Bezmialem Vakif University, originating from the roots of Gureba-i Müslimin, the first modern hospital of the Ottoman Empire that was founded in 1845 by Bezmiâlem Mother Sultana, was transformed into a university in 2010.</p> <p>Bezmialem Vakif University is one of the first thematic research universities in Health and Life Sciences in Turkey and also a non-profit foundation university which aims to make progress in education, research and health care. It provides education to about 3,500 students and clinical services to 8,000 patients daily with its two main hospitals and three outpatient clinics on both continents of Istanbul.</p> <p>The university aspires to keep alive a heritage that is over 175-years old. It aims to be a reference institution on a worldwide level with its four faculties: Medicine, Dentistry and Pharmacy as well as six departments under the Faculty of Health Sciences: Physiotherapy & Rehabilitation, Nursing, Audiology, Health Management, Occupational Therapy and Nutrition & Dietetics (https://bezmialem.edu.tr/en/Pages/homepage.aspx).</p>

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)	Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
			<p>Institute of Health Sciences includes 14 PhD programs namely Anatomy, Biotechnology, Disaster Medicine, Cardiopulmonary Physiotherapy and Rehabilitation, Clinical Pharmacology, Drug Discovery and Development, Medical Biochemistry, Medical Microbiology, Nursing, Oral Dental and Maxillofacial Surgery, Orthodontics, Pharmacognosy and Natural Products Chemistry, Prosthetic Dental Treatment and Restorative Dental Treatment which are executed in cooperation with the four faculties of Bezmialem Vakif University and their national/international cooperative universities.</p> <p>Collaborations are also made with other institutions and centers such as Life Sciences and Biotechnology Institute, Drug Administration and Research Center, Experimental Practice and Research Center, Phytotherapy Training, Application and Research Center, and Traditional and Complementary Medicine Advanced Research and Applications Center.</p> <p>Follow-up of publications</p> <p>Institutional affiliation (Department of, Institute of Health Sciences, Bezmialem Vakif University, Istanbul, Turkey) is being asked for the publications of PhD candidates.</p> <p>Since the Council of Higher Education (YÖK) requires all graduate students to use Open Researcher and Contributor ID (ORCID) in their publications, it is also used for tracking publications.</p> <p>In addition, the academic activities of all supervisors can be monitored up-to-date with the AVESIS system (https://avesis.bezmialem.edu.tr/).</p>

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)	Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
			<p>Some of the key papers published by our PhD candidates in respected journals are listed below:</p> <p>Department of Biotechnology 1- Alemdar, M., Tuncaboğlu, D. C., Batu, H. K., & Temel, B. A. (2022). Pluronic based injectable smart gels with coumarin functional amphiphilic copolymers. <i>European Polymer Journal</i>, 177, 111378.</p> <p>Department of Disaster Medicine 2- Kinik, K., Koçak, H., & Mayadağlı, A. (2022). Evaluation of the National Health System Utilization Status of the Syrian Refugees in Turkey Between 2011 and 2017. <i>Disaster Medicine and Public Health Preparedness</i>, 1-7.</p> <p>Department of Medical Biochemistry 3- Sarıkaya, U., Meydan, S., Selek, Ş., Sarıkaya, A., Demirel, M., Gül, A. Z., & Yıldız, T. (2022). Could the PON1 phenotype play a key role in insulin resistance?. <i>International Journal of Diabetes in Developing Countries</i>, 1-6.</p> <p>Department of Pharmacognosy and Natural Product Chemistry 4- Ceylan, B., Tırıs, G., & Tekkeli, S. (2021). A New HPLC Method with UV Detection for the Determination of Carnosol in Human Plasma and Application to a Pharmacokinetic Study. <i>Chromatographia</i>, 84(9), 855-860.</p> <p>Department of Cardiopulmonary Physiotherapy and Rehabilitation 5- Saka, S., Gurses, H. N., & Bayram, M. (2021). Effect of inspiratory muscle training on dyspnea-related kinesiphobia in chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: A randomized controlled trial. <i>Complementary Therapies in Clinical Practice</i>, 44, 101418.</p>

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)	Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.	
#2: BR 1.2	Facilities should be compatible with the requirements of completing the PhD project.	Yes	<i>Describe facilities available at the institution and from other institutions. Give examples.</i>	<p>There are research laboratories in each department for the PhD candidates to carry out their research. In addition, laboratories established in Life Sciences and Biotechnology Institute, Drug Administration and Research Center, Experimental Practice and Research Center, Phytotherapy Training, Application and Research Center, and Traditional and Complementary Medicine Advanced Research and Applications Center are open to all PhD candidates. The patients, equipment and all facilities at University Hospital, Dragos Hospital, Central Dental Hospital, Eyüp Additional Service Building, Fatih Additional Service Building and Sultangazi Additional Service Building can be used for research purposes providing the necessary permissions are obtained. Extensive library sources (print and electronic) (https://bezmialem.edu.tr/kutuphane/tr/Sayfalar/anasayfa.aspx) are available for candidates.</p> <p>If PhD candidates need to conduct their projects in another University or a research center stateside or abroad, additional time is granted to PhD candidates. In such cases, the research laboratory or the research center take its place in the project.</p>
#3: BR 1.3	Research should be consistent with international ethical standards.	Yes	<i>Provide reference to local ethical committee and other organizations concerned with maintaining ethical standards. How are these standards implemented?</i>	<p>Research projects have to be initially approved by an Ethical Committee if it is necessary. There are three Ethical Committees in Bezmialem Vakif University:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1- Ethical Committee for Clinical Research 2- Ethical Committee for Non-Invasive Research 3- Ethical Committee for Research on Laboratory Animals

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)	Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
			<p>These ethical committees are structured and functioning in line with the international ethical standards, Helsinki declaration, European directives, Council of Europe – Additional Protocol to the Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine Concerning Biomedical Research.</p> <p>All clinical studies in drug research have to be approved by the Ministry of Health prior to the study (https://www.titck.gov.tr).</p> <p>Research and Publishing Ethics is a compulsory course in all graduate programs of Bezmialem Vakif University.</p>
#4: BR 1.4	There should be provision for allowing PhD candidates to perform part of their programme in another institution, national and abroad.	Yes	<p><i>Describe the arrangements provided for allowing PhD candidates to spend part of their time in another institution. How many take advantage of these arrangements? Who covers the expenses?</i></p> <p>PhD candidates are allowed to perform part of their programme in another institution, national and abroad. Using the opportunities provided by ERASMUS+, PhD candidates may travel abroad and carry out their research in other Universities. So far, seven of our PhD candidates benefited from ERASMUS+ Student Mobility for Traineeships program. PhD candidates working as research assistants at Bezmialem Vakif University are allowed to conduct their research at other institutions abroad within the scope of Bezmialem Vakif University Academic Purpose Travel Directives.</p> <p>Besides, PhD candidates supported by Scientific and Technological Council of Turkey (TUBITAK) to carry out their research abroad. One of our PhD candidates benefited from TUBITAK 2214-International Research Fellowship Programme for PhD Students and one PhD candidate will benefit from the same fellowship programme at the end of 2022-2023 Spring semester.</p>

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)		Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is "No" please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
#5: QD 1.1	Institutions lacking facilities/expertise could collaborate with stronger institutions to obtain these.	Yes	<i>Describe collaborative arrangements with other institutions.</i>	Collaborations with stronger institutions are always possible for the PhD programmes of Institute of Health Sciences at Bezmialem Vakif University. PhD candidates can take limited number of courses from all institutions in Turkey. Supervisors can collaborate with research groups of other universities or make protocols with other institutions to be able to reach the facilities nonexisting in Bezmialem Vakif University. There are extensive collaborations with several research groups of Istanbul University, Yildiz Technical University, Istanbul Technical University, University of Health Sciences, Istanbul Medeniyet University and many more.
#6: QD 1.2	Possibilities for joint and double degrees could be explored.	No	<i>Are there arrangements for joint or double degrees? How many PhD candidates are currently using such a programme?</i>	Joint and double degrees are highly appreciated by Institute of Health Sciences at Bezmialem Vakif University. However, it is difficult to arrange joint or double degree programmes in health sciences due to regulations of the Council of Higher Education (YÖK). Joint or double degree programmes in health sciences are not allowed due to regulations of YÖK.
2. Outcomes				

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)	Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
#7: BR 2.1 PhD programmes should provide PhD candidates with competences to become qualified and independent researchers, according to principles of good research practice.	Yes	<i>What criteria are used to ensure that each PhD candidate has developed these competences?</i>	The PhD programmes of Institute of Health Sciences are designed to train PhD candidates with competences to become qualified and independent researchers. PhD candidates should complete compulsory and elective courses, including transferable courses, which could be theoretical and/or practical, present seminar and pass qualification exam prior to starting the thesis. The courses are given in first one year or in one and a half year since 2017. In addition, it is legally required for each PhD candidate to complete Research and Publishing Ethics course. A PhD thesis proposal should be prepared by each candidate and presented to PhD thesis monitoring committee.
			All candidates are also encouraged to prepare project proposals and to apply Bezmialem Vakif University Scientific Research Projects Unit for funding. Besides, ethical approval application documents if necessary should be prepared by PhD candidates. Each semester, PhD candidates should prepare the progression reports and present them to the thesis monitoring committee. The monitoring committee meets in specific periods and follow the candidate’s academic and scientific competencies and developments. The competencies of PhD candidates are also evaluated by the quality of the research thesis completed, scientific conferences attended, research papers that are prepared from the thesis, also national or international projects that have been involved during the PhD thesis.

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)		Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is "No" please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
#8: BR 2.2	A PhD degree should also be of benefit in a career outside academic or clinical research (problem solving, analysis, evaluation, technology transfer etc.).	<i>Maybe</i>	<i>What arrangements are made to ensure that each PhD candidate has developed these competences?</i>	Bezmialem Vakif University Technology Transfer Office organizes various meetings and provides information about national/international projects that PhD candidates can apply during and after their education. Center for Continuing Education and Research organizes several education activities to improve the knowledge, skills and competences in terms of personal and social aspects. Also, Career Development Center arranges seminars such as alumni interviews, personal and professional development seminars, and seminars for CV preparation and interview techniques.
#9: BR 2.3	The outcomes for PhD candidates with a background in medicine or other professional training are the same as for any other PhD.	<i>Yes</i>	<i>Are there any special arrangements for PhD candidates with background in professional training?</i>	Regardless of their background, all the PhD candidates should obey the same rules. Some PhD programs have obligatory preparation courses (1 or 2 semesters), including the transferable courses preparing them for
				research skills, for different background professionals including medicine and dentistry. Clinical practices in dentistry PhD programs continue in harmony with their PhD education programs. The expected outcome is same for all candidates. The PhD candidates from the clinical side are expected to carry-out 2.5 years of research. They take leave from their departments, or they are accorded spare time for research and/or the length of the PhD training is increased for them to complete their research.
3. Admission policy and criteria				

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)	Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.	
#10: BR 3.1	PhD candidates should be selected on the basis of a competitive and transparent process.	Yes	<i>Describe the admission process.</i>	PhD candidates are selected with a competitive and transparent process according to the regulations of YÖK. The candidates must have an MSc degree with thesis and must have an ALES score provided that it is not less than 55 points in the type of score of the program they are applying from. Then selections are made based on the total score calculated by taking 60% of ALES grade, 20% of MSc transcript grade (for MD applicants, it should be graduation transcript grade) and 20% of scientific evaluation exam grade. The acceptance score should be at least 65. Each PhD candidate can apply to more than one programme. The admission procedure is described on the website: https://bezmialem.edu.tr/saglik-bilimleri-enstitusu/tr/Sayfalar/Mevzuat.aspx However, ALES is not required for PhD, proficiency in art, specialization in medicine/dentistry/veterinary and pharmacy graduates. PhD candidates having MD degree may present a score of 50 over 100 from exam of specialty in medicine instead of ALES.
				It is obligatory for all PhD candidates to get at least 55 points from the central English language exams accepted by YÖK and the international English language exams accepted as equivalent. PhD candidates suitable for the application criteria for the programme have to successfully pass the scientific evaluation exam which could be carried out as oral, written and/or practical examination. Online application is possible for our institute.

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)		Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
#11: BR 3.2	Applicants for PhD programmes should have an educational level corresponding to a master’s degree.	Yes	<i>Describe the level required. Are persons with a medical degree or other professional degree accepted?</i>	The candidates should have an MSc degree, or be graduated from one of the medical (6 years), dentistry (5 years), pharmacy (5 years) or veterinary (5 years) faculties which correspond to MSc degree by the regulations of YÖK. These issues are clearly described on the website: https://bezmialem.edu.tr/saglik-bilimleri- enstitusu/tr/Sayfalar/Mevzuat.aspx
#12: BR 3.3	Before enrolment or at clearly defined times during the programme, the institution should evaluate and approve: - Scientific quality of the project, - Likelihood to complete within normal timeframe, - The possibility for candidate to provide creative input, - Qualifications of supervisors.	Yes	<i>Describe how and when the PhD project is approved.</i>	Qualifications of the nominated supervisors are evaluated before the application of the supervisor for a PhD candidate. The thesis supervisor is selected among the academic committee of the relevant programme. In order to be able to manage the thesis in PhD programmes, except for the departments of dentistry, pharmacy, medicine and veterinary faculties, at least one successfully completed MSc thesis supervision must be administered. In cases where the quality of the thesis requires more than one thesis supervisor, the second thesis supervisor may be from other universities, public or private sector, or retired persons provided that he/she has at least a PhD degree.

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)	Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
			<p>In order to clarify the qualifications, appointments, duties, powers and responsibilities of supervisors, a supervisor guide has been prepared and published on the website: https://bezmialem.edu.tr/saglik-bilimleri-enstitusu/en/Pages/Supervisor-Guide.aspx</p> <p>PhD candidates can choose their supervisors and upon supervisor’s approval they deliver their choice to the department head. The academic committee of department considers the preference of the PhD candidate and suggests a supervisor after a consensus is reached. Then the management board of our institute discusses the nominated supervisor in terms of his/her allocation time to the candidate and adequate proficiency to supervise.</p> <p>The title of the thesis and nominated supervisors are evaluated by the board of the institute (for every PhD candidate) when presented to the institute. Supervisors ought to have enough knowledge and experience in project topics. The scientific quality of the project is firstly evaluated by academic committee of the related department after which is also evaluated by the board of the Institute. The last and most critical evaluation is made by the thesis monitoring committee. Likelihood to complete within normal timeframe and the possibility for candidate to provide creative input are also evaluated and approved by the thesis monitoring committee.</p>

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)		Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
#13: BR 3.4	A PhD programme should only be initiated when the resources for completion are available.	Yes	<i>Describe how PhD programmes are financed and how it is ensured that full financing will be available.</i>	A PhD program is initiated after the approval of the Board of the Institute of Health Sciences, The University Senate and YÖK, respectively. Evaluation is based on the resources for infrastructure, supervision potential and the quality of the training programme. The PhD programs are funded by the University, TUBITAK, YÖK and various other private foundations.
				The funds may include part or the entire budget for research project, salary of the candidate and other expenses related with the program. According to YÖK law, at least 15% of the students must be free of charge in each graduate programme in foundation universities. It was found to be 32% on average in 2023 for our programmes.

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)		Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
#14: QD 3.1	In choosing PhD candidates, the applicants’ potential for research ought to be considered, not just past academic performance.	Yes	<i>Describe the application procedure, and the weight given to e.g. previous exam marks, research experience, expressed motivation, performance at interview, letters of recommendation, etc.</i>	Before every application period, the requirements of application are announced by the Institute according to the regulations of YÖK. The preliminary assessments are made based on the total score calculated by taking 60% of ALES grade and 40% of MSc transcript grade (for MD applicants, it should be graduation transcript grade). After that, the evaluation committees of each graduate programme evaluate the candidates by scientific evaluation exams (both written and oral). Final selections are made based on the total score calculated by taking 60% of ALES grade, 20% of MSc transcript grade (for MD applicants, it should be graduation transcript grade) and 20% of scientific evaluation exam grade. The acceptance score should be at least 65. In the written and/or oral scientific evaluation exam previous research experience, internships, expressed motivation and performance of the candidates are always considered by the jury members. In oral evaluation exam particularly undergraduate research projects and their willingness to participate in a research environment are discussed with the candidates.
#15: QD 3.2	Projects ought to be externally assessed by written project description or presentation to panel of independent scientists.	Yes	<i>Are PhD projects externally/independently assessed? Who does this?</i>	The PhD projects are assessed first by the “PhD thesis monitoring committee” which is composed of 3 members (supervisor and two experts on the field at least one of which is assigned from another university). The candidate defends the PhD project in front of the PhD thesis monitoring committee members. If the members find the project satisfactory, then the student may apply for grants to Bezmialem Vakif University Scientific Research Projects Unit (BAP) or to other funding resources such as TUBITAK. These project proposals are assessed by an independent panel arranged by the Funding bodies.

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)		Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is "No" please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
#16: QD 3.3	If the PhD candidate is obliged to obtain extra income, it ought to be ensured that the PhD candidate has the necessary time to complete the programme.	Yes	<i>Do PhD candidates get extra time for their project if they have to work for extra income (e.g. by teaching or clinical duties?).</i>	PhD candidates start their thesis at the beginning of 4th semester (in limited number of programmes at the beginning of 5th semester). In a well-planned thesis 2.5 years would be enough to complete the requirements. All PhD candidates including the students with obligation to obtain extra income have 4 years to finish their studies and they are informed about it both during the admission interviews and during their education by PhD candidates meetings. They can also extend their programme for 2 years according to the regulations of YÖK.
4. PhD training programme				
#17: BR 4.1	Programmes should be based on original research, courses and other activities which include analytical and critical thinking.	Yes	<i>Describe the content of PhD programmes.</i>	Each PhD programme has its own compulsory and elective courses which can also be classified as theoretical and/or practical courses. Additionally, there are some shared courses offered by the institute such as research and publication ethics, biostatistics and medical English. Transferable skills are offered to the PhD students by seminar and elective courses. The list of courses are being further developed according to the necessity and novel developments by programmes.
#18: BR 4.2	Programmes should be performed under structured supervision.	Yes	<i>Describe how the supervision process is structured.</i>	The supervision is defined by the regulations of the Institute of Health Sciences. The thesis supervisor is selected among the faculty members of the academic committee of the relevant program. An additional co-supervisor can also be assigned due to the necessity of the thesis. The thesis supervisor should be appointed by the end of the first semester.

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)	Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
			First of all, PhD candidates choose their supervisors and upon supervisor’s approval they deliver their choice to the department head. Then, the academic committee of department considers the preference of the PhD candidate and suggests a supervisor after a consensus is reached. Finally, the management board of the institute approves the nominated supervisor. The supervision process and the responsibilities of the supervisors are clearly explained in the supervisor guide.
#19: BR 4.3	Programmes should ensure that PhD candidates have appropriate training in ethics and responsible conduct of research.	Yes	At least one ethics course is mandatory according to the regulations of YÖK. Each PhD candidate has to take and complete Research and Publication Ethics course which is shared with all programmes.
#20: BR 4.4	Programmes should have clear 3-4 year timeframe. Extensions should be possible but limited and exceptional.	Yes	The duration of the programmes is clearly indicated as 4 years with the possibility of 2 years extension if necessary. The extension should be based on a good reason such as not reaching the number of publications required for graduation and should be approved by supervisor.

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)		Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
#21: BR 4.5	Programmes should include relevant activities not directly related to the project (e.g. courses, journal clubs, participation in conferences, seminars and workshops, including preparation time) totalling about 15% of the whole programme. A substantial part should be concerned with training in transferable skills. (NB. “training” can be liberally interpreted as all scientific activities not directly related to the project, e.g. journal clubs, conferences, etc.).	Yes	<i>Provide a list of courses and other activities. How are these assessed?</i>	Transferable skills are offered to the PhD candidates by courses such as seminar, research and publication ethics, biostatistics and medical English. In addition, PhD candidates can select several courses from different departments and/or different universities upon approval of the supervisor, department and the institute. All PhD students have to present their thesis work at least in one national/international conference before PhD thesis defence. Institute of Health Sciences organizes training programs such as how to prepare a research project, Turnitin training, EndNote training etc. together with Bezmalem Vakif University Technology Transfer Office and Library Directorate .
#22: BR 4.6	PhD programmes that are performed in parallel with clinical or other professional training should have the same time for research and course work as any other PhD.	Yes	<i>Describe the arrangements for PhD candidates who do their PhD parallel with the PhD studies. How is it ensured that such PhD candidates have sufficient time for their PhD studies?</i>	PhD programmes that are performed in parallel with clinical or other professional training have the same time for research and course work as any other PhD. The departments support the PhD candidates with academic/clinical duties by allowing them to do their PhD studies on certain days of the week. If their academic/clinical duties prevent carrying out their PhD studies PhD candidates have the opportunity to extend the duration of PhD provided that they do not exceed the legal deadlines.

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)		Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
#23: BR 4.7	Progress of PhD candidates should be continuously assessed by the institution throughout the PhD.	Yes	<i>Describe the arrangements to monitor PhD candidates.</i>	Progress of PhD candidates is continuously assessed by the institution from admission to graduation. All courses and exam results are digitally recorded and evaluated by the lecturers, supervisors and programme coordinators. Upon the collection of required ECTS (minimum 60 ECTS) from the courses a PhD qualification exam is held by a five membered jury at least two of which should be out of Bezmialem Vakif University. Following a successful qualification exam, there are defined timeframes for submission of a PhD project and thesis monitoring reports which are approved by thesis monitoring committee. Online student information system (OBS) modules of Bezmialem Vakif University allow to control the grades and to monitor the progress of the PhD candidates by administrative staff of the institute, supervisor and head of department.
#24: QD 4.1	For PhDs performed by clinicians, leave-of-absence from clinical duties could be provided for the PhD part of such programmes	Yes	<i>Is leave-of-absence provided?</i>	For PhDs performed by clinicians leave-of-absence from clinical duties are provided for their PhD studies with the approval of the heads of clinical departments.
#25: QD 4.2	PhD programmes could where relevant have an element of interdisciplinarity.	Yes	<i>What proportion of PhD projects could be termed “interdisciplinary”. Give examples.</i>	5 Programmes listed below are interdisciplinary and PhD projects carried out in these programmes could be termed as interdisciplinary. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1- Biotechnology 2- Clinical Pharmacology 3- Disaster Medicine 4- Drug Discovery and Development 5- Pharmacognosy and Natural Products Chemistry

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)	Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.	
5. Supervision				
#26: BR 5.1	Each PhD candidate should have a principal supervisor and normally at least one co-supervisor.	Yes	<i>How many supervisors do PhD candidates have? How are responsibilities divided?</i>	Each PhD candidate has a supervisor selected among the faculty members of the academic committee of the relevant program. An additional co-supervisor can also be assigned due to the necessity of the thesis. The co-supervisors are mainly from different disciplines, departments and/or universities. Co-supervisors are out of the PhD monitoring committee but can take place at the thesis monitoring meetings. The principal supervisor is responsible for the preparation of the study plan, ensures the progress and completion of the thesis, encourages the candidate’s participation to scientific conferences and supports the candidate to produce publications during PhD.
#27: BR 5.2	The number of PhD candidates per supervisor should be compatible with the supervisor’s workload.	Yes	<i>What is the usual number of PhD candidates per supervisor? What is the range?</i>	The average number of PhD candidates per supervisor is 3.03 (109 PhD candidates/36 supervisors) in our institute. Although according to regulations of YÖK 14 master and/or PhD students are allowed for each supervisor, the departments of the institute try to achieve a balanced distribution of candidates among supervisors.
#28: BR 5.3	Supervisors should be scientifically qualified and active scholars in the field concerned.	Yes	<i>Provide information about the qualifications required for a supervisor.</i>	The qualifications, appointments, duties, powers and responsibilities of supervisors are clearly explained in the supervisor guide which is prepared according to regulations of YÖK and published on the website: https://bezmialem.edu.tr/saglik-bilimleri-enstitusu/en/Pages/Supervisor-Guide.aspx

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)	Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
			First of all, in order to be able to manage the thesis in PhD programmes, except for the departments of dentistry, pharmacy, medicine and veterinary faculties, at least one successfully completed MSc thesis supervision must be administered. The supervisor must have an article published in journal within the scope of SCI-Expanded, SSCI or AHCI in the last three years or at least one book/book chapter/patent published in her/his own field of science.
#29: BR 5.4	Supervisors should have regular consultations with their PhD candidates.	Yes	<p><i>Provide information about the number and type of consultations that supervisors hold with their PhD candidates.</i></p> <p>Supervisors should meet PhD candidates at least two hours per week which is generally ensured by Specialty Courses. In practice the PhD candidates may consult their supervisors almost every day if needed and if supervisors are available. Student and supervisor agreement document sets the frame of responsibilities for both sides.</p>
#30: BR 5.5	It should be ensured that training for all supervisors and potential supervisors is available.	Yes	<p><i>Describe the training courses available. Provide information about number of supervisors who have taken these courses.</i></p> <p>The first supervisor training was carried out in 2019 with the participation of Prof. Dr. Gül Güner Akdoğan from Izmir Economy University. In 2020, we organized a supervisor meeting about changes made in regulations. Starting from 2022, we have planned the supervisor trainings that will be carried out regularly every year. The number of supervisors who have attended this training in 2022 was 42.</p>

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)	Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.	
#31: BR 5.6	The supervisor-candidate relationship is the key to a successful PhD programme. There should be mutual respect and shared responsibility.	Yes	<i>Describe the procedures taken to enhance the supervisor-candidate relationship. Describe how supervisors and PhD candidates are matched. Describe arrangements for solving supervisor-candidate conflicts.</i>	The mutual respect and shared responsibility is explained within the student and supervisor agreement. It is expected from both supervisor and PhD candidate to understand that a good relationship is the key to a successful PhD programme. These are also discussed in PhD candidates meetings and supervisor trainings. The thesis supervisor is selected among the faculty members of the academic committee of the relevant program. PhD candidates choose their supervisors and upon supervisor’s approval they deliver their choice to the department head. Then, the academic committee of department considers the preference of the PhD candidate and suggests a supervisor after a consensus is reached. Finally, the management board of the institute approves the nominated supervisor. We have an Ethics Advisory Board for solving supervisor-candidate conflicts. Both the candidate and the supervisor have the right to apply for a change if there is any kind of disagreement.
#32: BR 5.7	Institutional assistance should be provided for career development. This should be continuous, starting from the time of enrolment.	Yes	<i>Describe how and when PhD candidates are assisted in career development. How many PhD candidates take advantage of these arrangements?</i>	Career Development Center of the university supports both undergraduate and post graduate students by arranging seminars such as alumni interviews, personal and professional development seminars, and seminars for CV preparation and interview techniques. In addition, Institute of Health Sciences organizes training programs such as how to prepare a research project, Turnitin training, EndNote training etc. together with Bezmialem Vakif University Technology Transfer Office and Library Directorate .

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)		Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
#33: QD 5.1	Responsibilities of each supervisor ought to be explicit.	Yes	<i>Provide information about the responsibilities of the supervisor.</i>	The responsibilities of supervisors which are clearly stated in the Supervisory Guide are as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - to help candidate while selecting courses - to follow the candidate’s academic program - to arrange regular weekly meetings with the candidate - to guide candidate on exchange programs, study abroad opportunities and educational scholarships - to plan the thesis work with the candidate, to be a guide for the preparation of the necessary infrastructure for the study - to guide the thesis work to be done within the framework of universal ethical rules
#34: QD 5.2	Supervisors ought to have broad local and international scientific networks.	Yes	<i>How is it ensured that supervisors have suitable networks?</i>	The supervisors are part of individual departments at different faculties of Bezmialem Vakif University and their scientific activities and networks are followed by monthly Academic Activity Reports requested by the faculty. In addition, all faculty members have to update their scientific activities and networks in the AVESIS system (https://avesis.bezmialem.edu.tr/), and it is possible for the institute and faculty to follow them through the system.
#35: QD 5.3	Supervisors ought to assist with career development.	Yes	<i>How do supervisors assist with career development? Does the graduate school provide assistance?</i>	Supervisors support the candidates to improve their skills and develop their careers by including them to national/international projects, encouraging them to attend national/international conferences and introducing them to their networks. Moreover, the institute provide assistance for the career development of PhD candidates by organizing several meetings together with Career Development Center and Bezmialem Vakif University Technology Transfer Office .

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)		Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
#36: QD 5.4	Institutions could consider having contracts on the supervision process, signed by supervisor, PhD candidate and head of graduate school.	Yes	<i>Are such contracts being used?</i>	We have “student and supervisor agreement” document which is signed by PhD candidate, supervisor and Head of Institute of Health Sciences since 2019. https://bezmialem.edu.tr/saglik-bilimleri-enstitusu/en/Pages/Documents-and-Forms.aspx
#37: QD 5.5	The principal supervisor, at least, ought to have some formal training as supervisor.	Yes	<i>Provide information about training courses for supervisors. How many supervisors have had such courses?</i>	The first supervisor training was carried out in 2019 with the participation of Prof. Dr. Gül Güner Akdoğan from Izmir Economy University. In 2020, we organized a supervisor meeting about changes made in regulations. Starting from 2022, we have planned the supervisor trainings that will be carried out regularly every year. The number of supervisors who have attended this training in 2022 was 42.
#38: QD 5.6	Supervisors could where possible also act as co-supervisors for PhD candidates at other graduate schools.	Yes	<i>Is this common?</i>	Although it is not very common supervisors could also act as co-supervisors for PhD candidates at other graduate schools according to YÖK regulations.
#39: QD 5.7	Graduate schools ought to consider appointing a mentor or equivalent for each PhD candidate, in addition to the supervisor team, to discuss programmes from another aspect than the science topic alone.	No	<i>Are mentors appointed? If not, would it be a good idea?</i>	We don’t have a mentorship programme for PhD candidates but it would be a good idea.
6. PhD thesis				
#40: BR 6.1	The PhD thesis should be the basis for evaluating if the PhD candidate has acquired independent research skills and can evaluate work done by others.	Yes	<i>Is this correct for your institution? Does the institution have other means for assessing these competences?</i>	The PhD thesis is the basis for evaluating if the PhD candidate has acquired independent research skills and can evaluate work done by other. Other means for assessing these competences can be listed as follows:

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)	Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Seminar courses which helps the supervisor to understand if the candidate can evaluate work done by others - Submitting a PhD project to Bezmialem Vakif University Scientific Research Projects Unit - Reporting the progress of the thesis each semester to the monitoring committee - Presenting PhD studies at least in one national/international conference
#41: BR 6.2	The benchmark for a PhD thesis in health sciences is the equivalent of three <i>in extenso</i> papers in scientific peer-reviewed international journals. Manuscripts are also acceptable. It is the task of the assessment committee to determine if the material demonstrates 3-4 years of research at international level.	<i>Yes</i>	<p><i>Describe the content normally required by the institution for a PhD thesis regarding original work.</i></p> <p>In order to apply for PhD thesis defense the following conditions must be fulfilled;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) At least one research article related to the thesis and published or accepted in the journals that are covered by SCI-expanded (Science Citation Index Expanded) where the candidate is the first author, b) At least one research article published or accepted for publication in peer-reviewed journals, c) At least one research article submitted for publication in peer-reviewed journals, d) At least one oral or poster presentation related to thesis at a national/international conference, e) For those who have obtained a patent from national/international patent organizations related to the thesis study, the first name article is not required.

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)		Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
#42: BR 6.3	In defining the benchmark for a PhD thesis, the assessment committee should take account of the provisos listed in the Annotations, for example the annotation indicating that fewer than three papers may be accepted if published in highly rated journals.	Yes	<i>To what extent are the “normal” requirements as described in BR6.2 adhered to, and under what circumstances are other criteria accepted?</i>	For those who have obtained a patent from national/international patent organizations related to the thesis study, the first name article is not required. Apart from this, there is no case where less than three papers are accepted.
#43: BR 6.4	In addition to papers, the thesis should include a full literature review and full account of aims, method, results, discussion and conclusion.	Yes	<i>Describe the content of the other parts of the thesis.</i>	The thesis is basically composed of five parts which are literature review, materials and methods, results and discussion, and conclusion. The details of the thesis format and contents are explained in Thesis Writing Manual. https://bezmialem.edu.tr/saglik-bilimleri-enstitusu/en/Pages/Thesis-Writing-Manual.aspx
#44: BR 6.5	If the thesis is presented in other formats (e.g. as single monograph), the assessment committee should ensure equivalence to the above benchmark.	Yes	<i>How many theses are presented in other formats e.g. monographs?</i>	The thesis is written in a single format according to the Thesis Writing Manual, and any other format is not accepted. https://bezmialem.edu.tr/saglik-bilimleri-enstitusu/en/Pages/Thesis-Writing-Manual.aspx
#45: BR 6.6	A PhD thesis in clinical medicine should meet the same standards as other PhD theses .	Yes	<i>Is this correct for your institution?</i>	The same standards apply for PhD theses in clinical medicine.
#46: QD 6.1	The thesis ought to be written and optimally also defended in English, unless national regulations stipulate otherwise. An abstract of the thesis should be published in English.	No/ Yes	<i>Provide information about the language used in the thesis, and in the defence.</i>	The thesis is written and defended in Turkish. The abstract of the thesis is written both in Turkish and English. Students who have foreign supervisor and/or thesis monitoring committee member are able to write and defend their thesis in English. Additionally, in English PhD programmes all theses are written and defended in English.

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)		Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
#47: QD 6.2	If articles/manuscripts are joint publications, co-author statements ought to document that the PhD candidate has made a substantial and independent contribution. Ownership of results from PhD studies ought to be clearly stated.	Yes	<i>Describe the procedure used to identify the contribution of the PhD candidate to each of any multi-authored publications. What procedure is used to assess the accuracy of any statements made? Are there circumstances where the same publication is used in more than one thesis? How is the question of ownership dealt with?</i>	In case a publication is produced with another research group or other authors for instance as a result of a joint project, the international standards applied for co-authorship in the relevant field are valid. A signed statement clearly indicating the PhD candidate's contribution may be included to the thesis. The same publication cannot be used in more than one thesis unless equal contribution is present for first two authors. In this case, there must be a contract signed by all authors expressing the contributions of both candidates in the relevant study and which parts of this study they can use in their thesis.
#48: QD 6.3	PhD theses ought to be published on the graduate school's homepage, preferably <i>in extenso</i> . If patent or copyright legislation prevent this, at least abstracts of the theses ought to be publicly accessible.	Yes	<i>Provide information about how PhD theses are published.</i>	All PhD theses are published <i>in extenso</i> at the website of YÖK National Thesis Center (https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/) and if patent or copyright legislation is present the abstracts of the theses are accessible. The abstracts of all PhD theses are also available on our website (https://bezmialem.edu.tr/saglik-bilimleri-enstitusu/tr/Sayfalar/doktora-tez-ozetleri.aspx).
#49: QD 6.4	There could be a lay summary of the thesis in the local language.	No	<i>Describe the format of any lay summary.</i>	We don't have any lay summaries of the theses in Turkish.
7. Thesis assessment				
#50: BR 7.1	Acceptance of a PhD thesis should include acceptance of both written thesis and a subsequent oral defence.	Yes	<i>Describe the procedures for assessing the written thesis and the oral defence.</i>	Acceptance of the PhD thesis include acceptance of both written thesis and a subsequent oral defence. The thesis is firstly approved by the thesis monitoring committee to be defensible and to be prepared in accordance with the writing rules. The supervisor sends the copies of the thesis, the date and place of the thesis defense to the institute via the department head.

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)	Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.	
				<p>The institute receives plagiarism report related to the thesis and sends it to the assessment committee together with the thesis. The thesis oral defence must be held within a month at the latest after the assessment committee receives the thesis. The thesis defence consists of the presentation of the thesis and the following question and answer session. After the completion of the thesis defence, the assessment committee decides whether to accept, reject or correct the thesis with absolute majority. This decision is notified to the institute by the department within three days following the thesis defence.</p>
#51: BR 7.2	PhD degrees should be awarded by the institution on the recommendation of the assessment committee which has evaluated the thesis and the oral defence.	Yes	<i>Is this correct for your institution?</i>	PhD degrees are awarded by the Board of the Institute after the decision of the assessment committee.
#52: BR 7.3	The assessment committee should consist of established and active scientists without connection to the milieu where the PhD was performed and without conflict of interest. Min. two should be from another institution.	Yes	<i>How many members does the assessment committee have, how are they appointed and how is it ensured that there is no conflict of interest?</i>	The assessment committee consists of six members, three of which are the candidate's thesis monitoring committee and at least two of them must be from other universities. The supervisor has no voting rights and cannot be the head of the assessment committee. In case the second supervisor is appointed, he/she cannot be a member of the assessment committee.
#53: BR 7.4	The supervisor should not be a member of the assessment committee. If local regulations require this, the supervisor should not have a vote.	Yes	<i>Is this correct for your institution?</i>	The supervisor is a member of the assessment committee but has no voting rights.

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)		Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
#54: BR 7.5	If the assessment of the thesis/defence is negative, the PhD candidate should normally be given an opportunity to rewrite/an additional defence.	Yes	<i>What arrangements are there following a negative assessment?</i>	If the assessment committee decides the thesis to be corrected, another opportunity is given to the candidate to defend the revised thesis within six months at the latest. If the assessment of this defence is negative the candidate is deported from the PhD programme according to the regulations of YÖK.
#55: BR 7.6	The oral examination should be detailed enough to ensure that the thesis is the candidate’s own work, that the intended training goals have been achieved, and that the candidate is able to put the results into scientific context.	Yes	<i>Describe the format of the oral defence and the extent to which this is a true examination or more a traditional formality. Does the PhD candidate also give a lecture?</i>	The oral defence consists of the presentation of the thesis and the following question and answer session. The PhD candidate presents the aim, literature review, materials and methods, results and discussion, and conclusion of the thesis. Question and answer session take place after the presentation part.
#56: QD 7.1	The oral defence ought to be open to the public.	Yes	<i>Who is able to attend the oral defence?</i>	The oral defence is open to all lecturers, researchers, students and anyone interested in.
#57: QD 7.2	Where possible at least one member of the assessment committee could be from another country.	Yes	<i>What proportion of assessment committees includes members from another country?</i>	It is possible for at least one member of the assessment committee of PhD candidates who are in English PhD programmes or who are accepted to prepare their thesis in English to be from another country. In this case, it is possible for the assessment committee member from another country to participate the thesis defence online. Currently, one of our PhD candidates has a thesis monitoring committee member from another country.
#58: QD 7.3	Apart from the thesis, the institution ought to ensure that sufficient transferable skills have been acquired during the PhD programme.	Maybe	<i>How does the graduate school ensure that transferable skills have been acquired?</i>	Transferable skills are offered to the PhD students by courses such as seminar, research and publication ethics, biostatistics and medical English. In addition, PhD candidates can select several elective courses from different departments and/or different universities upon approval of the supervisor, department and the institute.

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)		Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
#59: QD 7.4	The competences developed during the PhD programme could be documented in a portfolio. This documentation could be evaluated by the assessment committee and form part of their decision concerning the award of the PhD degree.	Yes	<i>Do PhD candidates prepare a portfolio, and is this assessed as part of the decision on award of the PhD degree?</i>	In order to apply for PhD thesis defense a portfolio should be submitted. Portfolio should contain a CV prepared in ARBIS format, at least 3 research articles required for graduation, at least one oral/poster presentation related to the thesis study in national/international conferences, certificates, etc.
8. Structure of Graduate School				
#60: BR 8.1	The graduate school should have sufficient resources for proper conduct of PhD programmes. This includes resources to: Support admission of PhD candidates, implement the PhD programmes of the PhD candidates enrolled, assess PhD theses and award PhD degrees.	Yes	<i>Provide information about the resources available to the graduate school.</i>	Bezmalem Vakif University is a foundation university and Institute of Health Sciences has yearly budget. This budget is used for all the application and admission processes of PhD candidates, implement the PhD programs, assess PhD theses, award PhD degrees, prepare diplomas and graduation ceremonies. The institute carries out all the regulation and administrative implementations of the programs.
#61: BR 8.2	The graduate school should have a website in English and possibly also the national language including transparent information about the content of PhD programmes and the policies of the graduate school.	Yes	<i>Describe the website and give its URL. Refer to Best Practices document for type of information that is recommended.</i>	Institute of Health Sciences has both Turkish and English website, including all the required information from application to graduation. Website in English: https://bezmialem.edu.tr/saglik-bilimleri-enstitusu/tr/Sayfalar/anasayfa.aspx Website in Turkish: https://bezmialem.edu.tr/saglik-bilimleri-enstitusu/en/Pages/homepage.aspx
#62: BR 8.3	Merit should be given for courses taken elsewhere or other relevant experience.	Yes	<i>Is merit given? For courses? For previous research?</i>	Courses taken from other higher education institutions are accepted within credit limits. A maximum of two courses can be taken from other higher education institutions with the approval of the Board of the Institute.

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)		Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is “No” please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
#63: QD 8.1	There ought to be procedures for regular review and updating of the structure, function and quality of PhD programmes, including both supervisor and candidate feedback.	Yes	<i>Provide information about how this is performed.</i>	In order to review and update the structure, function and quality of PhD programmes annual questionnaires are performed to PhD candidates, supervisors and graduates by the institute. The results of these questionnaires are shared with the Board of the Institute and evaluated with programme directors.
#64: QD 8.2	Representatives of the PhD candidates ought to interact with the leadership of the graduate school regarding the running of the graduate school. Candidate organisations ought to be encouraged and facilitated.	Yes	<i>How are PhD candidates involved in the running of the graduate school? Is there a PhD association or equivalent?</i>	There is a representative of the PhD candidates who is always in contact with the Institute. All PhD candidates can contact easily with the representative via WhatsApp group. There is not a specific PhD association or equivalent.
#65: QD 8.3	PhD candidates ought to have rights and duties commensurate with the value (to the institution) of the research performed.	Yes	<i>Describe the rights and duties of PhD candidates. How much are PhD candidates paid?</i>	PhD candidates have the right to get qualified education, to have a competent supervisor and to ask for a change in supervisor. In return, the candidates should take and pass the compulsory courses of the program and develop required competencies, should prepare the research project with their supervisor, should present the project to the thesis monitoring committee every 6 months and defend the thesis both written and orally when completed, and should do the necessary studies for the publication of the research papers. Some of the candidates work as research assistants and are obliged to fulfill the duties assigned by the faculty they work as research assistants. There are also PhD candidates having fellowship grants from The Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey (TUBITAK).

Basic Recommendations (abbreviated - see Best Practices document for full recommendations)		Does your institution comply? Yes, No, Maybe.	Please expand your answer with the following information. If the answer is "No" please indicate if you would like to make changes that would allow compliance. If such changes are not wanted, please explain.	Response. Please be succinct and refer to e.g. graduate school website where relevant.
#66: QD 8.4	There ought to be an appeal mechanism allowing PhD candidates to dispute decisions concerning their programmes and thesis assessment.	Yes	<i>How can PhD candidates appeal?</i>	The PhD candidates can appeal by a written appeal letter. The appeal mechanism proceeds stepwise; first to the director of the programme, next academic board of the programme, board of the institute, higher boards of the university. The appeal mechanism also works for any problems with the supervisor. The candidate should contact firstly with department head, and if the conflict is not resolved, the candidate should apply to the Ethics Advisory Board.
#67: QD 8.5	Confidential candidate counselling concerning e.g. the PhD programme, supervision, as well as personal matters ought to be offered by the graduate.	Yes	<i>Describe what counselling facilities are available, and the degree to which the counsellor is independent of the doctoral school leadership and supervisors. How many PhD candidates use such facilities each year?</i>	Psychological Counseling and Guidance Office of Bezmialem Vakif University supports all students of the university. The counsellor is independent of the institute and supervisors. Until now, no PhD candidate using this facility has been reported.
#68: QD 8.6	Graduate schools could consider having a thesis committee for each PhD candidate that monitors the progress of the PhD candidate through meetings with the PhD candidate and the supervisors.	Yes	<i>Do PhD candidates have a thesis committee? Who is on this committee?</i>	All PhD candidates should have thesis monitoring committee which is a legal requirement according to guidelines of YÖK. The thesis monitoring committee consists of three members- supervisor and two experts on the field at least one of which is assigned from another university. Co-supervisors are out of the PhD monitoring committee but can attend the thesis monitoring meetings. The progress of the PhD candidate is followed through meetings every 6 months. PhD candidate should prepare progression reports and present his/her results in an oral presentation to the thesis monitoring committee.

**Please provide any recommendations
you may have for improvement of this
questionnaire**

For institutions that would like to have input from ORPHEUS

The completed questionnaire should be sent to the Chairman of the ORPHEUS Labelling Board, Prof. Michael Mulvany, Aarhus University, Aarhus, Denmark. Tel. +45 28992189, mm@farm.au.dk, who will arrange for expert facilitators to examine the responses and provide suggestions. In this case, please also provide the core data indicated below.

Please note that this service is only available for members of ORPHEUS. Please note also that this information is to provide facilitators with a general overview of the institution, and precise data are not needed; estimates are sufficient.

Please confirm that your institution is a member of ORPHEUS in good standing	Orpheus member since 2017
Name, position and e-mail of person completing the questionnaire	Prof Dr Binnur TEMEL, Vice Director of Institute of Health Sciences baydogan@bezmialem.edu.tr
Name of PhD organization responsible for PhD education (e.g. Graduate School of ...)	Institute of Health Sciences
Name of the University or Faculty of which the PhD organization is a part	Bezmialem Vakif University
Name and e-mail of the head of the PhD organization	Prof Dr Semra ÖZÇELİK semraozcelik@bezmialem.edu.tr
Name and e-mail of the head of the PhD organization administration	Hasibe Oya GÖKTÜRK hgokturk@bezmialem.edu.tr
Total number of PhD candidates (PhD students) currently enrolled	Total number of enrolled PhD candidates in 2022-2023 academic year is 109.
Gender, age, etc. of PhD candidates	31 Male 78 Female The average age is 30
Number of PhD candidates who entered the graduate school in most recent year (give date)	40 September 2022- March 2023
Number of dropouts in most recent year (give date).	6 January 2022- March 2023
Number of PhD theses successfully defended in most recent year (give date)	8 January 2022- March 2023
Total number of international PhD candidates currently enrolled	1
Number of qualified persons available to the Graduate School for supervision (supervisor pool)	254
Number of current principal supervisors	36
Number of current co-supervisors	8
Number of PubMed publications of supervisor pool in most recent year	535
URL of the PhD organization (website address)	https://bezmialem.edu.tr/saglik-bilimleri-enstitusu/tr/Sayfalar/anasayfa.aspx https://bezmialem.edu.tr/saglik-bilimleri-enstitusu/en/Pages/homepage.aspx